***Transformative impacts in the existing curriculum: A study of developing learner agency and broadening career horizons***

Guadalupe López Íñiguez1 and Dawn Bennett 2

1Sibelius Academy, University of the Arts Helsinki, Finland; 2Bond University, Australia

*Dedication: To a dear friend, sage advisor, brilliant mind, and valued colleague.*

**Introduction[[1]](#endnote-1)**

Around the globe, music majors study music because they are passionate about it. They may have a notion of how difficult it can be to establish a career in performance, but the excitement of being able to dedicate themselves to music overrides all else. Perkins (2008) and others have found that music students’ career related concerns tend to surface in the first year of study, when they see the quality of music making around them. These concerns are often heightened as students become more aware of the nature of music careers and the fierce competition for work.

Awareness also comes in the form of negative media and graduate outcomes statistics. Many Western countries conflate graduate employment rates with the quality of post-secondary education, fuelling negative media about the arts and increasing pressure to produce “employable” graduates (Ramberg et al., 2019). In Australia, for example, the assumed economic unimportance of the Arts and Humanities led the Federal Government to increase student contributions for these programs, making them far more expensive than programs in science, engineering and maths (Titelius, 2020). The economic value of creative higher education for graduates in relation to their employability is also a concern in Europe (e.g., Bloom, 2020; REACT, 2021), where economic inequalities in the music industry (Bull, 2019) and increasing cuts for arts education are becoming the norm.

Despite a persistent narrative about the divide between higher music education and the realities of musicians’ work (Bennett & Bridgstock, 2015; Calissendorf & Hanneson, 2017; Dobson, 2010; López-Íñiguez & Bennett, 2020; Schmidt, 2014), there are myriad examples of innovative curricula and pedagogical approaches that have had a transformative impact on students’ career thinking. Glen Carruthers (2019, p. 209) wrote that many institutions have tried “to reconcile curriculum and identity, broadening the scope of higher music education to include more career-relevant courses … and modules”. However, as Glen pointed out there is often “a missing link. Although identity and curriculum can be symbiotic, a catalyst is required to bind the two together. The catalyst lacking in most legacy curricular is agency”. This article describes the impact of fostering music students’ learner identity to encourage the agency through which students might begin to create their musical futures.

**The importance of being a learner**

In precarious industries such as music, the task of remaining employable demands the regular and strategic self-renewal of skills and knowledge (Gill, 2002), realised through a *learner identity* (López-Íñiguez & Bennett, 2020; 2021; López-Íñiguez et al., 2022). Alongside learner agency, this study sought to develop a learning mindset among student musicians, fostering their curiosity about the many developmental and exploratory opportunities made available to music students (Brown, 2009; Ha, 2019; Varvarigou, et al., 2014).

In the pre-professional context, “learning how to learn requires learning to be a learner” (Sinha, 1999, p. 41) who is open to exploring possible futures and to regulating identity and career thinking in line with each new experience (Sfard & Prusak, 2005). We defined a learner identity as a central identity of socio-constructivist orientation with which individuals identify and construct themselves as learners in different educational and developmental contexts (Falsafi, 2011).

**Theoretical framework**

Perceived employability – students’ confidence that they will successfully transition into the workforce – is strongly correlated with efficacy beliefs. Efficacy beliefs underpin student health and wellbeing, retention, study success, academic engagement, and agentic behaviours (Berntson & Marklund, 2007).

Following Vygotsky (1978), we sought to create a constructivist learning ecology (Barron, 2006). Specifically, we designed a replicable class that featured authentic and scaffolded strategies in support of students’ metacognitive engagement, active participation and experiential learning. The study was grounded in the three modalities of learner identity construction defined by Falsafi (2011) as *in* activity, *on* activity and *cross* activity (see Figure 1). Such construction is situated and encompasses both intra-psychological (e.g., motivational and emotional) processes involved in the construction of learner identity, and the inter-psychological processes developed through working and learning with other people (Falsafi & Coll, 2015).



Figure 1. Characteristics of the learner identity model. Reproduced from López-Íñiguez & Bennett (2021), with permission.

**The study**

The study explored students’ career-related thinking and confidence and drew on the findings to transform a previously generic class on career development into a student-facing career intervention. We asked three questions:

1. To what extent might a semester-long class be transformed using student-derived data?
2. How effective is the intervention in helping students to become conscious of their learner identity?
3. Is this approach scalable without additional funding or curricular space?

Participants were purposefully selected and came from five different nations and diverse socio-economic backgrounds. Invitations to participate were relayed via the head of the music department. Students signed consent forms following the guidelines of the national advisory board and students were not obliged to participate. Ethical approvals were obtained from the institution’s research ethics committee. The seven participating students (P1-P7) were classical musicians (female *n* = 5, male *n* = 2) enrolled in post-graduate studies. Participants committed to participating in research seminars across a 12-week semester and they were compensated with one study credit following the European Transfer Credit and Accumulation System (ECTS).

Phase 1 featured semi-structured interviews with each participant. In Phase 2, participants created personalised employability profiles using an online tool (Bennett, 2019). The tool prompted students to rate their confidence in relation to self-management and decision-making, academic self-efficacy, self-esteem, professional identity, conceptualisations of self and employability, emotional intelligence, and career commitment and agility.

The findings of Phases 1 and 2 informed the design and content of four 90-minute lectures and seminars of increasing difficulty (Phases 3A and 3B). Phase 4 featured a discussion panel with eight musicians who were internationally recognised as being highly proficient in multiple roles. Student participants provided feedback on all four phases via email. The study employed phenomenological, lexicometrical and descriptive analyses as appropriate for each phase.

**Results**

***Phase 1: Interviews***

Participants’ professional profiles and developmental needs were coded by applying lexicometrical analysis using Leximancer software to the interview transcripts. Participants highlighted the importance of *performance* but also the need for variety within and beyond performance roles. To achieve this, they realised the need to develop greater industry awareness alongside personal, artistic and professional autonomy. All participants articulated the needto develop their skills and industry experience. Increased autonomy was again a feature, as was the need to develop work-life balance.

Participants noted that social interaction and communication skills were crucial to establishing and maintaining their careers. They also recognised the importance of *networking*. However, the development of such skills was sometimes labelled as something to tackle “in the future”, despite being described as urgent. Finally, participants discussed personal commitments, life design and the need to think ahead.

***Phase 2: EmployABILITY self-reflection***

Students’ responses to the online employABILITY tool (Bennett, 2019; Bennett & Ananthram, 2021) revealed a lack of confidence in students’ self-report of occupational literacy. Analysis revealed that this related to a lack of career exploration, career/industry awareness and occupational flexibility. These concerns were evident in the phase 1 narratives. Lack of confidence in emotional literacy related to managing the emotions of others and to managing one’s own emotions, particularly in relation to stressful situations. These themes were explored in Phase 3.

***Phase 3: Classes developed from the student data***

Phase 3 featured four 90-minute lecture seminars. The classes had previously focussed on issues of generic importance to musicians’ career development. The intervention enabled the classes to respond to the specific needs of the students, using the findings of Phases 1 and 2. Resources within a freely available online music career toolkit were employed to scaffold the learning; these included resources on critical reflection and career planning*.*

Participants articulated their strong commitment to a career in music and they recognised that this commitment demanded a learning mindset, resilience, patience, motivation, confidence, courage, industry awareness, stress management strategies, a positive attitude, and mental wellness. Three of these themes are drawn out below.

*Planning a career*

Participants identified multiple long- and short-term goals and they were aware of the need to create a sustainable income through multiple roles. However, they expressed inadequate understanding of small business management, career management, and work generation. Participants emphasised that insufficient career awareness was inhibiting their ability to make informed career decisions, and they wanted more exposure to the work of experienced colleagues and the career narratives of successful musicians alongside strategies with which to develop their professional networks.

*Ethical behaviour*

Some participants had experienced competition and exclusionary practices from established performers, suggesting the need for early career mentorship and peer networks. Participants requested information about musicians’ rights and obligations, both in relation to these practices and also on practical matters such as what rates to charge for their work and how to manage under-prepared or difficult colleagues.

*Scholarship*

Although participants were keen to improve the quality of their playing and their ability to learn repertoire quickly, they were initially disinterested in engaging with their repertoire in a scholarly way. Over the course of the sessions, they began to describe the adoption of reflexive behaviour: for example, reflecting on their performances to promote new learning and improvements. Participants reported immediate benefits from the critical thinking activities and in the final sessions they expressed interest in both critical thinking and scholarly practices with which to research the music they were performing.

*Wellbeing*

Participants emphasised the importance of physical and mental wellbeing. Stress became more clearly defined over the course of the sessions and was attributed to financial insecurity and the impact of extensive work-related travel on both health and relationships. Participants requested emotional coping strategies.

**Discussion**

We adopted a learning ecology framework in which students played an active role in the inter- and intra-psychological construction of knowledge (Vygotsky, 1978). By designing the classes based on the student-derived data, students’ learning and identity construction were historically and socially situated within in a community of practice (Norton & McKinney, 2011). As trust developed within the community, participants began to express doubts, concerns and possibilities. As a result, participants shared many stories of pre-professional and professional life, and these combined to broaden their career thinking, career curiosity and learner agency.

After the intervention, participants revealed a positive attitude to learning and a more inclusive view of career pathways and musical identities. Their eventual openness to discussing concerns with colleagues (the inter-psychological dimension) and the acts of recognising everyone as a learner within the situated educational space was a stark change from the Phase 1 activities.

Participants began to recognise that success as a musician profession demands more than performance excellence and that identifying themselves as learners would support their ongoing professional learning (realising or avoiding possible future identities).

Finally, participants began to challenge the absence of career learning and other career-related capabilities within the curriculum, and they acknowledged that they would need to take the lead in meeting some of their career visioning and associated learning needs.

**Conclusions and recommendations**

The CEPROM theme *Transformative impacts* might conjure visions of major reforms. In contrast, we asked the extent to which a semester-long class could be transformed using student-derived data, whether such a short intervention could help students to become conscious of their learner identity, and whether the approach might be scalable without additional funding or curricular space. We took an existing, semester-long class broadly themed as career development, and used students’ self-reported confidence data to inform the content of the four lecture seminars. The study was undertaken without additional project funding and utilised a free student self-assessment tool and associated career learning resources.

The intervention had a transformative impact on student musicians’ development not because of their particular learning needs but because they began to embrace both a learning mindset and of the more inclusive musician identities needed for career exploration. The additional tasks included student completion of the online self-assessment tool, which was a 30-minute required task, and approximately one hour in which we discussed the results as presented in an educator report and selected resources from the online toolkit. We concluded that these tasks were far from onerous and were scalable to other classes and contexts.

The study illustrates the potential for in-curricular interventions to positively impact learner identity, career curiosity and learner agency. Indeed, the diversity of views to which students were exposed when working collaboratively and discussing the results of their self-report developed rich discussions within the safety of a learning community. The use of established tools and resources ensured that student learning was scaffolded and that academic staff who were non-experts in career learning could understand and address these complex issues.

We acknowledge that the course into which we taught had a class dedicated to career development and that this is rarely the case. Professor Dumbledean would argue that this is no excuse for the absence of transformative learning experiences in the education of musicians. We end with his words, and with the intention of following his advice as we identify further opportunities for students to explore their emerging musician identities and career thinking.

Often, courses were created because they reflected the teaching and/or research interests of faculty members, and these courses would align with the interests of students by chance rather than by design. Which courses should be maintained, eliminated, introduced or transformed, and which deserve enhanced funding or human resources, cannot be determined unless the connection between course outcomes and degree-level expectations is clear. (Carruthers, 2019, p. 23-24)

**Acknowledgements**

The study was undertaken during a fellowship held by Guadalupe López-Íñiguez, funded by the Academy of Finland (Ref.: 315378). The authors thank the students who were at the centre of this study.

**Links to the self-assessment tool and resources**

Website: <https://developingemployability.edu.au>

Contact: Please email dabennett@bond.edu.au

**References**

Barron, B. (2006). Interest and self-sustained learning as catalysts of development: A learning ecology perspective. *Human Development, 49*(4), 193–224. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000094368>

Bennett, D. (2019). *Embedding employABILITY thinking across higher education.* Australian Government Department of Education and Training. https://altf.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/Developing-EmployABILITY-draftfellowship-report-1.pdf

Bennett, D., & Ananthram, S. (2021). Development, validation and deployment of the EmployABILITY scale. *Studies in Higher Education*. Published *online first.* <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2021.1888079>.

Bennett, D., & Bridgstock, R. (2015). The urgent need for career preview: Student expectations and graduate realities in music and dance. *International Journal of Music Education*, *33*(3), 263–277. https://10.1177/0255761414558653.

Bloom, M. (2020). *For love or money? Graduate motivations and the economic returns of creative higher education inside and outside the creative industries* [Report]. Creative Industries Policy & Evidence Centre. <https://www.pec.ac.uk/assets/publications/PEC%20research%20report%20-%20For%20Love%20or%20Money.pdf>

Bull, A. (2019). *Class, control, and classical music.* Oxford University Press.

Brown, J. E. (2009). Reflective practice: A tool for measuring the development of generic skills in the training of professional musicians. *International Journal of Music Education*, *27*(4), 372–382. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761409345437>

Calissendorf, M., & Hanneson, H. F. (2017). Educating orchestral musicians. *British Journal of Music Education, 34*(2), 217–223. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051716000255>

Carruthers, G. (2019). Leaders and leadership in higher music education: Meeting the challenges. In D. Bennett, J. Rowley, & P. Schmidt. (Eds.), *Leadership and musician development in higher music education* (pp. 14–32). Routledge.

Dobson, M. C. (2010). Insecurity, professional sociability, and alcohol: Young freelance musicians’ perspectives on work and life in the music profession. *Psychology of Music, 39*(2), 240–260. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735610373562>

Falsafi, L. (2011). *Learner identity: a sociocultural approach to how people recognize and construct themselves as learners* (Doctoral Thesis). University of Barcelona, Spain. Available at <http://www.psyed.edu.es/prodGrintie/tesis/Falsafi_Thesis.pdf>

Falsafi, L, & Coll, C. (2015). Influencia educativa y actos de reconocimiento. La identidad de aprendiz, una herramienta para atribuir sentido al aprendizaje [Educational influence and acts of recognition. Learner identity, a tool to attribute learning meaning]. *Papeles de Trabajo sobre Cultura, Educación y Desarrollo Humano*, *11*(2), 1619.

Ha, J. (2017). The careers of three experienced string teachers: Some observations. *International Journal of Music Education*, *35*(4), 601–620. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761416689842>

López-Íñiguez, G., & Bennett, D. (2020). A lifespan perspective on multiprofessional

musicians: Does music education prepare classical musicians for their careers? *Music Education Research, 22*(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2019.1703925>.

**López-Íñiguez, G.**, Pérez-Echeverría, M. P., Pozo, J. I., & Torrado, J. A. (2022). Student-centred music education: principles for improving learning and teaching. In J. I. Pozo, M. P. Pérez-Echeverría, G. López-Íñiguez, and J. A. Torrado (Eds.), Learning and teaching in the music studio. A student-centred approach(pp. 369–385). Landscapes: The Arts, Aesthetics, and Education, vol 31. Springer.

Norton, B., & McKinney, C. (2011). An identity approach to second language acquisition. In D. Atkinson (Ed.), *Alternative approaches to second language acquisition* (pp. 73–94). Routledge.

Burt-Perkins, R. (2008). Students at a UK conservatoire of music: Working towards a ‘diverse employment portfolio’? In D. Bennett, & M. Hannan (Eds.), *Inside, outside, downside up* (pp. 49–60). Black Swan Press.

Ramberg, U., Edgren, G., & Wahlgren, M. (2019). Capturing progression of formal knowledge and employability skills by monitoring case discussions in class. *Teaching in Higher Education, 26*(2), 246–264. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2019.1657396>

**REACT – Rethinking Music Performance in European Higher Education Institutions.** (2021). Artistic career in music: Stakeholders requirement report[*.*](https://ria.ua.pt/bitstream/10773/32808/1/REACT_SRR%20%20%20VF.pdf)UA Editora. <https://ria.ua.pt/bitstream/10773/32808/3/SRR_Final_Version1.pdf>

Schmidt, P. (2014). Creativity as a framing capacity in higher music education. In P. Burnard (Ed.), *Developing creativities in higher music education* (pp. 23–36). Routledge.

Titelius, R. (2020). Politics in the pub: Report against the fees hike for arts and humanities degrees, Perth, WA. Guardian (Sydney), (1929), 3. Available at <https://search.informit.org/doi/10.3316/informit.354659993555031>

Sinha, C. (1999). Situated selves: Learning to be a learner. In J. Bliss, R. Säljö, & P. Light (Eds.), *Technological resources for learning* (pp. 32–46). Pergamon.

Varvarigou, M., Creech, A., & Hallam, S. (2014). Partnership working and possible selves in music education. *International Journal of Music Education*, *32*(1), 84–97. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761413491060>

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind and society. The development of higher psychological processes*. Harvard University Press.

1. Note: This is a short and amended version of an article by the authors published in the International Journal of Music Education. The original article is available under the [Creative Commons CC-BY-NC](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/) license and permits non-commercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. The original article is here: https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761421989111. [↑](#endnote-ref-1)